

**TOWN OF MORAGA
PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING**

Dance Room
Hacienda de las Flores
2100 Donald Drive
Moraga, CA 94556

January 18, 2011

7:30 P.M.

MINUTES

I. CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Driver called the Special Meeting of the Planning Commission to order at 7:30 P.M.

ROLL CALL

Present: Commissioners Levenfeld, Obsitnik, Richards*, Socolich, Whitley, Driver

* Commissioner Richards arrived at 7:40 P.M.

Absent: Commissioner Wykle

Staff: Lori Salamack, Planning Director

B. Conflict of Interest

There was no reported conflict of Interest.

II. ADOPTION OF MEETING AGENDA

On motion by Commissioner Obsitnik, seconded by Commissioner Socolich and carried unanimously to adopt the meeting agenda, as shown.

III. ANNOUNCEMENTS

There were no announcements.

IV. PUBLIC COMMENTS

There were no comments from the public.

V. ADOPTION OF THE CONSENT CALENDAR

A. October 4, 2010 Minutes

B. November 1, 2010 Minutes

The Adoption of the Consent Calendar was moved to Item VII, Public Meeting, as Item B.

VI. PUBLIC HEARINGS

- A. **CUP-06-2008 - Chris Avant (Applicant/Owner), 925 Country Club Drive.** An application for an amendment to the conditional use permit for the Moraga Barn located on the ground floor of the building at 925 Country Club Drive to extend the hours of operation and to expand its food and beverage offerings. The proposed new hours of operation are 6:00 A.M. to 12:00 A.M., and, the previous approval for wine and cheese now includes but is not limited to coffee, pastries, smoothies, salads, soups, tapas, and other finger foods. The amendment of the use will require minor interior alterations including the remodel of the layout and the relocation of the serving counter. The previously approved 43 seats and parking modification (14 on-site parking spaces less than the required 22 on-site parking spaces) are to remain unchanged. The property is zoned CC (Community Commercial). APN: 257-190-048.

Planning Director Lori Salamack reported that a use permit application had previously been approved by the Planning Commission for a wine bar at the Moraga Barn, which application focused on the serving of wine and cheese with an evening venue. That application also included a parking modification. The applicant now requested the expansion of the hours of operation and the food and beverage offerings. The hours of operation would be from 6:00 A.M. to 12:00 A.M. with the serving of coffee, pastries, smoothies, salads, soups, tapas, and other finger foods. Full restaurant offerings would not be provided given that there was no cooking hood. Entré food items would be limited to finger foods and other cold items that would be prepared elsewhere.

Commissioner Whitley clarified with staff that the originally approval hours of operation were from 4:00 P.M. to midnight.

PUBLIC HEARING OPENED

Chris Avant, the owner of the Moraga Barn, 925 Country Club Drive, Moraga, explained that he had purchased the building in 2006 and had made improvements since 2007. While developing the wine bar concept there had been plans to place it in the existing reception desk area of the building although it would now be expanded into the lounge area. In order to create a viable business, he stated that the hours of operation must be expanded, as proposed, in order to cover the morning and lunch hour periods. The business would operate much like a restaurant with fresh healthy foods while still retaining the wine bar ambience with a focus on local wine growers and makers.

Mr. Avant stated that the business would also be a site for local community events which had been envisioned to help the business succeed. He reported that the current plans, as proposed, had been reviewed and approved by the County Health Department. He added that water/irrigation would be captured on the site and there would be few impacts associated with the expansion.

In response to Commissioner Socolich as to whether or not the business had ever operated as previously approved, Mr. Avant acknowledged that had not occurred. At the time he had received the approved permits from the Town he had approached the Alcoholic and Beverage Control (ABC) Board to obtain the required licenses. The business had not been built out. He noted that once he had started the process, he had been found that the business model that would work was what was now being proposed.

Commissioner Richards arrived at 7:40 P.M.

Sol Captain, Moraga, requested clarification as to whether or not lunch entrées would be served beyond finger foods. He also questioned whether or not the Moraga Barn would compete with local restaurants.

Mr. Avant explained that they were limited as to what could be prepared in terms of raw foods. He planned to have healthy breakfasts, lunch, and dinner items although the menu would be more tapas oriented, with smaller finger food type dishes. The menu had not been finalized but would be along the lines of finger foods. As such, he suggested there would be no competition with local restaurants.

Ann Callacray, Moraga, asked when the Moraga Barn would be open for business.

Al Teasdale, Moraga, expressed his appreciation for the historical restoration of the Moraga Barn but opposed the potential competition to surrounding businesses such as a nearby café which had operated as an outstanding business that should be encouraged to remain in the community. He suggested that the application would create direct competition to established businesses and would create a dilemma for the Town resulting in destructive competition. He questioned whether or not the area could support two potentially identical businesses. He asked that the application not be granted and that the hours of operation not be expanded. He recommended that the application be conditioned to avoid any direct conflict.

Mr. Teasdale also expressed concern with the parking situation in the area, with surrounding businesses, and with private offices creating a parking demand beyond the current parking availability. He suggested that was another reason to deny the application.

Edy Schwartz, President of the Moraga Chamber of Commerce, recognized the comments of concern related to competition but stated that based on her experience in the business community there was a way to work out any problems, potentially through marketing. She suggested that there was enough business in the Town to support the Moraga Barn. As to the parking constraints, she noted that parking issues associated with 24-Hour Fitness and the restaurant owners had been resolved through signage in the parking lot. She added that efforts had been made to work closely with St. Mary's College in that students had requested such a business and one that was open late in the evening. She understood that having such a business for students with coffee and healthy foods would be supported. She also supported the business for the community as a whole in that there were few places in the Town to patronize after hours. She urged the Commission to seriously consider the application and work through the problems to allow the business to operate.

Allen Sayles, Moraga, stated that he was very familiar with and supported the project. He suggested that there was a fair amount of parking around the surrounding properties and a tremendous amount of underused street parking. He noted that both the hardware store and Orchard Supply Hardware (OSH) had been doing well in the current economy and he was confident having more than one choice would draw customers to both the Moraga Barn and the nearby café.

Tony Zarillo, Moraga, Owner/Operator of Vicenza Ranch and Vineyard, supported the application noting that he was one of several hundred wine growers in the area. He explained that there was a cottage industry that was growing and there was a need for a venue to sell and display their products. The site would allow a location to display local wine production, for sales, and to offer a wine venue. He explained that wine and vineyard growers were excited about the proposed operation and the extended hours which would make it more viable for the business. It would also allow the occupancy of a vacant building. He urged the Commission to support the application.

Bill Durkin, Moraga, supported the concept of the Moraga Barn, which as a building had recently been the Leadership in Environmental Design (LEED) and Green Building Rating System Platinum Certified. He saw the Moraga Barn as a model for the Town and a community asset in terms of support of local businesses, with a community-minded spirit.

Mr. Durkin suggested that the building had a great deal of potential for the entire community. He supported the idea of the business and suggested that the Moraga Barn would thrive.

Susan Captain, Captain Videos, Moraga, was excited with the plans for the Moraga Barn and its historical significance for the Town. She also liked the sustainability aspect of the Moraga Barn. She supported the business as a fabulous place for the community.

An unidentified speaker liked the fact that the Moraga Barn would be brought back to life and would offer a place to go in the evening which was limited in Moraga. As to the early hours of operation competing with the café, it was suggested that the hours of operation could potentially be moved up.

Another unidentified speaker did not see that competition was bad for any business.

PUBLIC HEARING CLOSED

REBUTTAL:

When asked, Mr. Avant identified the wine room and the location of eight on-site parking spaces. He commented that by opening the parking lot for the morning operations parking could be accommodated in the parking area and not on the street. He suggested that there was adequate parking in the parking lot area. In response to concerns with parking becoming an issue in the future, he noted that the Town had proposed a plan to help develop a two-lane roadway to calm traffic and to create a more pedestrian area. He was confident the businesses in the immediate area could work together and could bring more business to the area. He emphasized that he had analyzed his business plan and the requested modifications were necessary to make the business viable.

Commissioner Levenfeld understood the reason for the request and asked staff whether or not the application/business plan, if granted, could be further modified.

Ms. Salamack explained that if the applicant decided that the hours of operation were more critical from 7:00 A.M. to 11:00 P.M., as an example, the applicant did not have to come back to the Commission once the application was approved. As another example, if there was no market for smoothies but the business did well with a cold fruit salad, the food offerings could be modified.

Ms. Salamack explained that the applicant may not make the business a full restaurant given the lack of a hood for major cooking. Such a modification would require Planning Commission approval. She clarified that the Town would not audit the menu of the Moraga Barn unless a major departure to the menu later came to the Town's attention when a modification to the application would be required.

In response to Commissioner Socolich, Mr. Avant clarified that beer and wine would be sold, such as bottled and imported beer and wine. He took this opportunity to thank the community for its support.

Commissioner Whitley suggested that the business would be a benefit to Moraga. As to the concerns with respect to competition, he stated that was not the role of the Commission to determine. He noted, however, that he had serious reservations in 2005 about the proposal because of the parking. Those concerns had been mitigated in 2008 because the hours of operation had been designated from 4:00 P.M. to midnight when there would be little action in that part of the Town where a lot of parking would be available on the street. Expanding the hours of operation in the morning and evening would be at a time when there were more people moving around Town. In addition, the parking situation had changed since the initial approval. He acknowledged that street parking was available in the area although the café had little parking. He recognized a consensus of the Commission to approve the application, although he remained concerned that parking was woefully inadequate on the site.

Commissioner Levenfeld commented that she had previously worked in the area where the office buildings were located and had parked near the Moraga Barn. She did not see that the parking was as impacted as Country Club Drive which was typically congested. She also did not see the side street as a parking issue. She suggested it might be possible for the applicant to work out a mutual parking arrangement with OSH.

Commissioner Socolich stated that he was also familiar with the area and as a customer of OSH he had not seen many vehicles park along the street other than across the street. He suggested that the area east of Country Club Drive had sufficient parking spaces.

Commissioner Richards agreed. Based on his experience as a customer of OSH and the café, he had never seen a parking problem. He found the parking to be transient. He noted that the business was new, it was not known how popular it may or may not be, and he did not want to limit the approval based on parking since that factor was unknown at this point. He was confident based on his experience that parking would not be an issue.

Commissioner Obsitnik referenced the original approval and the approved eight parking spaces with the assumption that there would be more traffic in the morning or at noon versus the evening period. He noted that the Commission was not certain of the traffic volume in the morning or evening. Based on the prior approval, the business had been allowed with adequate parking. He did not see that an expansion of hours would make a material difference. He suggested that the more crowded morning coffee location was at Starbucks.

Chairman Driver recognized the consensus on the parking issues. He did not have any personal concerns with the parking and noted that the Commission was not at a point to entertain any additional conditions.

On motion by Commissioner Levenfeld, seconded by Commissioner Socolich to adopt Resolution next in number to approve CUP-06-2008 for Avant at 925 Country Club Drive, subject to the findings and conditions as shown. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes:	Commissioners Levenfeld, Obsitnik, Richards, Socolich, Driver
Noes:	Commissioner Whitley
Abstain:	None
Absent:	Commissioner Wykle

Ms. Salamack identified the 10-day right of appeal of a decision of the Planning Commission in writing to the Planning Department subject to an applicable appeal fee.

VII. PUBLIC MEETING

- A. Study Session - Former Bowling Alley site, next to AAAAA Rent-A-Space, Moraga Road, Galen Grant (Applicant) Mike and Jim Knuppe (Owners).** The property owners are proposing development of a residential subdivision on the former bowling alley site. According to the proposal, "The owner/applicant is proposing to develop this site with 36-40 apartments and townhomes to meet the housing needs of the local workforce and St. Mary's students, professors, visiting staff, etc. A concept site plan has been created to explore a potential land use option wherein a central core of housing, pool, spa, green space, etc. is surrounded by housing which fronts on four property lines." The property is zoned LC (Limited Commercial). All uses, other than agriculture, require a conditional use permit.

Ms. Salamack reported on the potential application for the former Bowling Alley site, next to AAAAA Rent-A-Space on Moraga Road. The former bowling alley building had been demolished years ago and the property has remained vacant since that time but used for a holiday tree lot. There have been several different uses considered for the property. The proposed 36 to 40 unit density would be allowed in the Moraga Center Specific Plan Area (MCSP) but the Town did not have a Specific Plan for the Rheem Valley Shopping Center. The property is not currently zoned residential although Institutional uses were allowed on the property and an argument could be made that the proposed development, targeted for St. Mary's College students and staff, was Institutional. She noted that market rate housing may require a rezoning application. The conceptual site plan would be considered by the Design Review Board (DRB) to consider design issues on Monday, January 24. The Planning Commission's comments would be forwarded to the DRB.

Jim Knuppe introduced his Architect, Galen Grant, and identified himself as the Owner of AAAAA Rent-A-Space. He spoke to the number of studies that had prepared for the site.

Michael Knuppe offered a background of the property, reported on the number of studies that had been prepared for potential development for the property, and the consideration of a hotel development which had proven not to be viable, and which had led to the apartment/townhome concept with marketing towards St. Mary's College students and faculty.

Galen Grant, Architect, presented a PowerPoint presentation on the conceptual plan for 36 to 40 stacked apartments and townhomes, a three-story project to remain within the 35-foot height limitation, with 75 percent of the area to be landscaped, buildings to be designed compatible with the neighborhood with a pool, outdoor patios, meeting room and exercise room areas, spa and green space areas. The design would include twin entries, a 25-foot landscaped frontyard setback, a gateway and access through the center.

There may also be opportunities for St. Mary's students to utilize the storage at AAAAA Rent-A-Space. All units would consist of one to two bedrooms, would have a one or two-car garage with guest parking provided on-site. The Mission architectural style would be stepped down to two stories at the entry gateway on both sides. A significant increase in traffic impacts was not anticipated.

Six speakers, most unidentifiable, spoke to the proposed conceptual plan for the former bowling alley site, and offered comments, as follows:

- The access road to the rear of the adjacent AAAAA Rent-A-Space should be considered for overflow parking given the marketing of the units to St. Mary's College students and faculty;
- Concerns expressed with potential pedestrian and traffic impacts along Moraga Road; questions as to what traffic studies had been prepared on ingress/egress to the property; and concerns with the left-hand turning movement onto Moraga Road;
- Request for clarification on the total number of parking spaces and guest parking with consideration of reducing the green area and increasing the parking accommodations given the potential occupancy being targeted;
- Support for the applicant/owner given they were business owners and mindful of the community;
- Mixed support for the building elevations, architecture and the conceptual plan with concerns with a boxy appearance;
- Recommendation that the site could be better used as a location for the Farmer's Market;
- Concerns expressed with a three-story development impacting views of nearby residents;
- Recommendation for the consideration of a traffic signal, lighted pedestrian crossing or safe island in the center to allow pedestrians to safely cross Moraga Road;
- Questions as to how the housing need for St. Mary's College had been incorporated into the project and whether or not any studies had been prepared to support that need;
- Questions as to how occupancy would be tied to St. Mary's College students and faculty;
- Questions as to whether or not St. Mary's College had a stake in the development; and
- Encouragement for the preparation of a Specific Plan for the Rheem Valley Shopping Center.

The Planning Commission discussed the conceptual plan for the former bowling alley site and offered the following comments:

- Recommended the consideration of a live/work unit option at the frontage;
- Serious concerns expressed with the way the pedestrian circulation would be addressed;
- Concerns expressed with the traffic impacts on Moraga Road; with little support for a traffic signal at that location;
- Concerns with the occupancy being tied to St. Mary's College students and faculty as to how the units would be presented to the community if marketed to students/faculty and then sold at market rate;

- A traffic study must be prepared for the project with concerns with local circulation issues that could arise in front of the driveways and at Moraga Road;
- Support for the proposed development with the site appropriate for the density and use being proposed; with the concept of more people patronizing the shopping center a benefit;
- Support for market rate units;
- An overlay district or update to the Zoning Ordinance may be necessary given concerns with the site designation as Industrial which may not ultimately be supported;
- Concerns expressed with the parking particularly if parking was not permitted along Moraga Road;
- The treatment of the road should be better defined;
- The proposed density of the development would meet the goals of the Housing Element and General Plan;
- The DRB to review any issues with the scenic corridor;
- Recommended the consideration of retail customers for the side of the street where the storage facility is located; and
- Recommended consideration of a potential center median to be used as a bus stop.

**B. October 4, 2010 Minutes
November 1, 2010 Minutes**

On motion by Commissioner Socolich, seconded by Commissioner Richards to approve the October 4, 2010 Minutes, as shown.

Ayes:	Commissioners Levenfeld, Socolich, Richards, Driver
Noes:	None
Abstain:	Commissioners Obsitnik, Whitley
Absent:	Commissioner Wykle

The meeting minutes from the November 1, 2010 meeting were continued to the next regularly scheduled Planning Commission meeting of February 7.

VIII. ROUTINE & OTHER MATTERS

There were no routine and or other matters.

IX. COMMUNICATIONS

A. None

X. REPORTS

A. Planning Commission

There were no Commission reports.

B. Staff

1. Update on Town Council actions and future agenda items.

Ms. Salamack reported that the Town Council meeting of January 26, 2011 would include action on the Rancho Laguna II Appeal. The next meeting of the Planning Commission scheduled for February 7 would include consideration of an ordinance to prohibit medical marijuana uses in Moraga. In addition, the Town Council would be holding a Goal Setting Session on February 9, 2010 at 7:00 P.M. when public comment would be encouraged.

Ms. Salamack also clarified, when asked the status of the Dollar Tree Store application, that the approval was valid for one year subject to certain conditions of approval prior to the business opening. Since Town Council approval of the application, Town staff has had no communications with either the applicant or Kimco Realty. A copy of the final conditions imposed by the Town Council could be provided to the Commission. She added that the Town had received no new applications from Kimco Realty.

Ms. Salamack added that the Hetfield Estates Environmental Impact Report (EIR) would be released this week with a public hearing scheduled with the Planning Commission on March 7, 2011. Further, the Town Council would be conducting Town commission/committee interviews on February 16 and 23 at 6:00 P.M. prior to the regularly scheduled meetings for those dates.

XII. ADJOURNMENT

On motion by Commissioner Socolich, seconded by Commissioner Levenfeld to adjourn the Planning Commission meeting at approximately 10:11 P.M. to a regular meeting of the Planning Commission on Monday, February 7, 2011 at 7:30 P.M. at the Moraga Library Meeting Room, 1500 Saint Mary's Road, Moraga, California.

A Certified Correct Minutes Copy

Secretary of the Planning Commission